Lending Next to the Courthouse: Exposure to Adverse Events and Mortgage Lending Decisions

(*Da Huo* *Mingzhu Tai* *Yuhai Xuan*)

Arkodipta Sarkar
HKUST

ABFER
May 2021

Summary

- **This paper:**

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**
  - Distance of loan officer's work place and county courthouse

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**
  - Distance of loan officer's work place and county courthouse
- **Empirical Strategy**

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**
  - Distance of loan officer's work place and county courthouse
- **Empirical Strategy**
  - Within county and within bank comparison of loan officers with varying distance to court.

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**
  - Distance of loan officer's work place and county courthouse
- **Empirical Strategy**
  - Within county and within bank comparison of loan officers with varying distance to court.
  - Within-county-year controls for local macroeconomic shocks

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**
  - Distance of loan officer's work place and county courthouse
- **Empirical Strategy**
  - Within county and within bank comparison of loan officers with varying distance to court.
  - Within-county-year controls for local macroeconomic shocks
- **Findings**

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**
  - Distance of loan officer's work place and county courthouse
- **Empirical Strategy**
  - Within county and within bank comparison of loan officers with varying distance to court.
  - Within-county-year controls for local macroeconomic shocks
- **Findings**
  - 8.2% increase in rejection rate.

Summary

- **This paper:**
  - studies the way exposure to foreclosure news can impact lending decisions.
  - attributes the effect to be driven by changes in risk preference or beliefs of individuals exposed to foreclosure news.
- **Instrument for salience of forclosure news**
  - Distance of loan officer's work place and county courthouse
- **Empirical Strategy**
  - Within county and within bank comparison of loan officers with varying distance to court.
  - Within-county-year controls for local macroeconomic shocks
- **Findings**
  - 8.2% increase in rejection rate.
  - 9.5% lower mortgage origination.

Comment 1: Motivation

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or

2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or
2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or
2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first
  - There exist literature that talks about individuals exposure to different events like great depression, communal conflicts, disasters affect their preferences.

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or

2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first
  - There exist literature that talks about individuals exposure to different events like great depression, communal conflicts, disasters affect their preferences.
  - Why is this scenario of forclosure events/news particularly different?

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or
2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first
  - There exist literature that talks about individuals exposure to different events like great depression, communal conflicts, disasters affect their preferences.
  - Why is this scenario of forclosure events/news particularly different?
  - Is the takeaway about existence of temporary distortion in individual preferences?

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or
2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first
  - There exist literature that talks about individuals exposure to different events like great depression, communal conflicts, disasters affect their preferences.
  - Why is this scenario of forclosure events/news particularly different?
  - Is the takeaway about existence of temporary distortion in individual preferences?
- If its the Second

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or

2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first
  - There exist literature that talks about individuals exposure to different events like great depression, communal conflicts, disasters affect their preferences.
  - Why is this scenario of forclosure events/news particularly different?
  - Is the takeaway about existence of temporary distortion in individual preferences?

- If its the Second
  - It is more interesting and novel in the context of literature.

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or

2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first
  - There exist literature that talks about individuals exposure to different events like great depression, communal conflicts, disasters affect their preferences.
  - Why is this scenario of forclosure events/news particularly different?
  - Is the takeaway about existence of temporary distortion in individual preferences?

- If its the Second
  - It is more interesting and novel in the context of literature.
  - The authors could quantify the misallocation/distortion of credit across counties (Restuccia, Rogerson 2013)

Comment 1: Motivation

1. Is the motivation about identifying whether individual's exposure can affect decision making; or
2. Is the motivation about microfounding individual's preference as a potential source for aggregate credit misallocation

- If its the first
  - There exist literature that talks about individuals exposure to different events like great depression, communal conflicts, disasters affect their preferences.
  - Why is this scenario of forclosure events/news particularly different?
  - Is the takeaway about existence of temporary distortion in individual preferences?
- If its the Second
  - It is more interesting and novel in the context of literature.
  - The authors could quantify the misallocation/distortion of credit across counties (Restuccia, Rogerson 2013)
  - Measure the misallocation contributed by individual preferences.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Distance can possibly be a measure for higher information (Degryse and Ongena 2005).

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Distance can possibly be a measure for higher information (Degryse and Ongena 2005).
- Loan officer closer to the court house can get soft information about the prevailing market conditions.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Distance can possibly be a measure for higher information (Degryse and Ongena 2005).
- Loan officer closer to the court house can get soft information about the prevailing market conditions.
- Information advantage would also predict a higher rejection and lower loan disbursal.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Distance can possibly be a measure for higher information (Degryse and Ongena 2005).
- Loan officer closer to the court house can get soft information about the prevailing market conditions.
- Information advantage would also predict a higher rejection and lower loan disbursal.
- Consequently the effect observed in the paper could be due to higher information and not preference.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Distance can possibly be a measure for higher information (Degryse and Ongena 2005).
- Loan officer closer to the court house can get soft information about the prevailing market conditions.
- Information advantage would also predict a higher rejection and lower loan disbursal.
- Consequently the effect observed in the paper could be due to higher information and not preference.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Shift in preference would entail that loan officers sacrifice profit to fulfill there preference.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Shift in preference would entail that loan officers sacrifice profit to fulfill there preference.
- Consequently there should be lower profits in branches close to the court.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Shift in preference would entail that loan officers sacrifice profit to fulfill there preference.
- Consequently there should be lower profits in branches close to the court.
    - Measures of Default.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Shift in preference would entail that loan officers sacrifice profit to fulfill there preference.
- Consequently there should be lower profits in branches close to the court.
  - Measures of Default.
  - Measures of Return on Loans.

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Shift in preference would entail that loan officers sacrifice profit to fulfill there preference.
- Consequently there should be lower profits in branches close to the court.
  - Measures of Default.
  - Measures of Return on Loans.
- Lower appetite for risk would also imply higher screening leading to a higher dispersion in the loans disbursed

Comment 2: Alternate Story

- Shift in preference would entail that loan officers sacrifice profit to fulfill there preference.
- Consequently there should be lower profits in branches close to the court.
  - Measures of Default.
  - Measures of Return on Loans.
- Lower appetite for risk would also imply higher screening leading to a higher dispersion in the loans disbursed
  - High standard deviation in the lending portfolios.

Comment 3: Identification

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality
  - Could reduced credit supply itself cause higher foreclosure?

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality
  - Could reduced credit supply itself cause higher foreclosure?
  - It would be helpful if the authors to provide an event time graph?

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality
  - Could reduced credit supply itself cause higher foreclosure?
  - It would be helpful if the authors to provide an event time graph?
- α_{ct}: county$\times$year allows estimate from across branch or bank.

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality
  - Could reduced credit supply itself cause higher foreclosure?
  - It would be helpful if the authors to provide an event time graph?
- α_{ct}: county×year allows estimate from across branch or bank.
  - branch/bank specific heterogeneities within county.

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality
  - Could reduced credit supply itself cause higher foreclosure?
  - It would be helpful if the authors to provide an event time graph?
- α_{ct}: county$\times$year allows estimate from across branch or bank.
  - branch/bank specific heterogeneities within county.
- α_{bt}: bank$\times$year allows estimate from across county.

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality
  - Could reduced credit supply itself cause higher foreclosure?
  - It would be helpful if the authors to provide an event time graph?
- α_{ct}: county$\times$year allows estimate from across branch or bank.
  - branch/bank specific heterogeneities within county.
- α_{bt}: bank$\times$year allows estimate from across county.
  - County specific heterogeneities of operation of the same bank

Comment 3: Identification

- Reverse Causality
  - Could reduced credit supply itself cause higher foreclosure?
  - It would be helpful if the authors to provide an event time graph?
- α_{ct}: county×year allows estimate from across branch or bank.
  - branch/bank specific heterogeneities within county.
- α_{bt}: bank×year allows estimate from across county.
  - County specific heterogeneities of operation of the same bank
- Is it possible to look at officer rotation?

Other Comments

Other Comments

- A relevance test of distance as an instrument for salience

Other Comments

- A relevance test of distance as an instrument for salience
  - News paper mentions

Other Comments

- A relevance test of distance as an instrument for salience
  - News paper mentions
- Reallocation from treated to control counties leading to overestimation of the impact

Other Comments

- A relevance test of distance as an instrument for salience
  - News paper mentions
- Reallocation from treated to control counties leading to overestimation of the impact
- Placebo with randomly distributed location of courthouses

Other Comments

- A relevance test of distance as an instrument for salience
  - News paper mentions
- Reallocation from treated to control counties leading to overestimation of the impact
- Placebo with randomly distributed location of courthouses
- It is not clear what is "*log Foreclosure*" dummy capturing after including countyαyear fixed effects

Other Comments

- A relevance test of distance as an instrument for salience
  - News paper mentions
- Reallocation from treated to control counties leading to overestimation of the impact
- Placebo with randomly distributed location of courthouses
- It is not clear what is "*log Foreclosure*" dummy capturing after including countyαyear fixed effects
- Could potential data from Credit Unions add any benefit

Other Comments

- A relevance test of distance as an instrument for salience
    - News paper mentions
- Reallocation from treated to control counties leading to overestimation of the impact
- Placebo with randomly distributed location of courthouses
- It is not clear what is "*log Foreclosure*" dummy capturing after including countyαyear fixed effects
- Could potential data from Credit Unions add any benefit

Conclusion

Conclusion

- Interesting paper showing the effect of salience on decision making

Conclusion

- Interesting paper showing the effect of salience on decision making
- Emphasis on the importance of it in aggregate credit misallocation would be great

Conclusion

- Interesting paper showing the effect of salience on decision making
- Emphasis on the importance of it in aggregate credit misallocation would be great
- Some more evidence on the preference/belief formation as channel would be helpful

Conclusion

- Interesting paper showing the effect of salience on decision making
- Emphasis on the importance of it in aggregate credit misallocation would be great
- Some more evidence on the preference/belief formation as channel would be helpful
- Looking forward to read the next draft

Thank You !